SOM Inclusive Economic Development Ideas Lab: Rethinking Community Engagement

Prof Kate Cooney and Students: Uzma Amin, Marisa Berry, Arianna Blanco, Joy Chen, Norbert Cichon, Brice Eidson, Charles Gress, Stephen Henriques, Evan Oleson, Tessa Ruben, Naomi Shachter, Alexandra Sing, Allen Xu

IEDL Spring 2020

Images Source: New Haven Independent
Overview of Inclusive Economic Development Lab at Yale SOM

**Deliverable #1** Appreciative Inquiry Method for IED/ VOICES reports pilot

**Deliverable #2** Cutting Edge Models for Community Engagement—6 domains

**Recommendations** for Greater New Haven
Anika Singh Lemar, Yale Law School
David Schleicher, Yale Law School
David Dodson, Made in Durham
Jerry Rubin, Jewish Vocational Services
Kirsten Delegard, Mapping Prejudice
Kevin Ehrman-Solberg, Mapping Prejudice
Sarah Camiscoli, Integrate NYC
Eric Gordon, Director Engagement Lab
Elihu Ruben, Yale School of Architecture
James Johnson-Piett, Urbane Development
Prabal Chakrabati, Boston Fed
Robert Shiller, Yale School of Management
Barbara Biasi, Yale School of Management

**Season 2: Rethinking Community Engagement**
(August 2020 publication date)!
Deliverable #1

Appreciative Inquiry and Inclusive Economic Development/VOICES report
Inspired by BakerRipley in Houston, TX

A COMMUNITY WITH CHARACTER

In Houston, BakerRipley has hes been home to the adventures of the Phoenix community center, open to the public for the first time of December. The club offers classes and after-school activities for kids from our newest neighbors, including the Phoenix Kids Magnet School and the community. The Phoenix neighborhood char is the unique culture that is a part of our rich history, where children are raised with passion and a sense of belonging. It is a place where families can come together, where roots run deep, and where there is a strong sense of community. This is a place where people can feel at home, where they can connect with others, and where they can celebrate their differences.

CLOSE AND CONNECTED

This is a community of thinkers and learners who are interested in social justice and the development of the Phoenix community. They have recently joined a project on the go in partnership with the community center, a shelter for the Phoenix community. The Phoenix community center has been a home for those who are in need of shelter and food. Their mission is to provide a safe and welcoming environment for all.

LOOKING FORWARD IN THE EAST END

Everyday, two homes have a community in the East End of. In 2018, there are 150 homes in the community. To make it easier for everyone to get together, the community is planning to create a community center where people can come together and celebrate their differences. This is a place where people can feel at home, where they can connect with others, and where they can celebrate their differences.

ALL TOGETHER FOR A HEALTHIER ECONOMY

We believe that the key to advancement is through education. We are working to create a community center where people can come together and learn from each other. This is a place where people can feel at home, where they can connect with others, and where they can celebrate their differences.

LEARNING IS THE KEY FOR ADVANCEMENT

Everyday, two homes have a community in the East End of. In 2018, there are 150 homes in the community. To make it easier for everyone to get together, the community is planning to create a community center where people can come together and celebrate their differences. This is a place where people can feel at home, where they can connect with others, and where they can celebrate their differences.

GLASS, STEEL AND CONCRETE

The new East End Community Center will be a place where people can come together and celebrate their differences. This is a place where people can feel at home, where they can connect with others, and where they can celebrate their differences.

BakerRipley is a community development organization that empowers people to build a better future for themselves and their community. Inspired by BakerRipley in Houston, TX, our mission is to provide a safe and welcoming environment for all.

85% of the population is white, compared to the national average of 70%. This is a place where people can feel at home, where they can connect with others, and where they can celebrate their differences.

75% of residents are of Spanish or English language.

37% of households have income sources of $25,000 or lower, compared to the national average of 25.5%.

Residents, businesses, and community organizations, stand hand in hand in this community. This is a place where people can feel at home, where they can connect with others, and where they can celebrate their differences.
Inspired by BakerRipley in Houston, TX

1 on 1 interviews
Focus Groups
VOICES report—large community meeting
Create shared vision
Action teams form

Key Community Aspirations

A Community with Character

Create a shared vision, form action teams, and make positive changes through the community and the leaders of the community.

Steps:

85% of the population is Spanish-speaking
75% of residents live where Spanish is the primary language spoken
37% of households have annual incomes of $25,000 or less
3% and 1% of households have incomes of less than $25,000 and less than $15,000 respectively

Project Goals

- Create a shared vision
- Form action teams

Steps:

1. 1 on 1 interviews
2. Focus Groups
3. VOICES report—large community meeting
4. Create shared vision
5. Action teams form

A Community with Character

The East End is a community with a rich history. The neighborhood is known for its diverse population and strong sense of community. The residents are passionate about preserving their cultural heritage and fighting for social justice.

CLOSE AND CONNECTED

This is a community of hardworking families and long-time residents who are committed to building healthy, safe, and vibrant communities. The residents of East End are known for their resilience and their strong sense of community. They are committed to creating a better future for their families and their neighbors.

Steps:

1. 1 on 1 interviews
2. Focus Groups
3. VOICES report—large community meeting
4. Create shared vision
5. Action teams form

Looking Forward in the East End

The East End is a community of hardworking families and long-time residents who are committed to building healthy, safe, and vibrant communities. The residents of East End are known for their resilience and their strong sense of community. They are committed to creating a better future for their families and their neighbors.

Steps:

1. 1 on 1 interviews
2. Focus Groups
3. VOICES report—large community meeting
4. Create shared vision
5. Action teams form

Community Connections

Residents, business owners, and community organizations collaborated on 12 key initiatives to grow the community. The project built on the efforts of all stakeholders, who cooperated to create positive change.
Piloting the VOICES approach

“Off the record” conversations with select community leaders and residents in Greater New Haven & Archival research
CITY THAT SUPPORTS ONE OTHER

“Community rich in love, supporting one another.”

“I knew I was going to do everything in my ability to change this city and provide safety for these children.” - Sean Reeves

Grandfather was a “force multiplier” in his community, I also try to “make people look better than they are”, honoring dignity of neighbors coping with poverty. - Orlando Yarborough

CITY OF STRIVERS

“I had to do what I needed to do to make a life for myself because that’s what he did.” - Bruce Trammell

“My choice to lean in and get through this.” - Allyx Schiavone

“I always wanted to be a teacher...and he said, ‘How you doing? Are you a teacher yet? I said, ‘Yeah, I’m in school to become a teacher.’ He said, ‘I knew you’d be a teacher.’” - Erik Clemens

I was 4 and she got a new testament that had one column English and one column Spanish. That summer, by working everyday, I learned the alphabet. I learned to distinguish letters, words and then was able to read full sentences by the end of the summer.” - Lee Cruz

“I go up to Mr. Deluca, I speak English, I shouldn’t be here (in ESL) so he clearly understands I speak English, but there is no process to get me out. So he talks to the counselor and he says, we don’t know what to do because there is no process. I had to go to a psychologist so that they could determine I could speak English which I had been speaking all along.” - Lee Cruz

“From here, as far as you could see, there were factories, men walked home from work with their lunch packs, tired, proud.” - Stacy Spell

CITY OF DREAMERS

“ITook longer than most but I arrived. And it was one of the most transcendent experiences of life—seeing the top of Machu Picchu...I had an epiphany, I thought, to accomplish my work, all I have to do is take one step at a time.” - Eric Rey

“I’m trying all these things—nothing’s working. I’m listening to all these voices telling me ‘go this way, go that way.’ I said you know what, at some point, I need to stop and listen to myself, to reflect and really, really figure out what makes me passionate, what fuels my spirit and really feeds me on a spiritual level.” - Ashley Burney

CITY OF FAMILIES

“I come from the second biggest black family in New Haven, and we were tied to Newhallville. You couldn’t throw a rock without hitting someone from my family.” - Stacy Spell

Learning to appreciate and draw on siblings strengths in adulthood—Elizabeth Nearing

Even caught in cycle of violence and trauma, support found in extended family, community and ‘other mothers’—Kelly Knight

“Excuse me, I said and I introduced myself, when I was 14 or 15 years old, I was in some trouble and I used to see you on the train, and I would watch you, just wanted to thank you for being a role model for me because you really saved my life” - Erik Clemens

CITY WRITING ITS OWN STORY

Cycle of violence and trauma, untiring desire for health and fulfilling human relationships and connection—Kelly Knight

“We are still here” - Stacy Spell

The shame of being a black single mother, I wanted everything but that, I didn’t want that label and stigma. I learned to love motherhood. I embraced it. I want more for him. - Kia Levey-Burden
DIXWELL

A Historic Community

In 1638, the first house of worship was built in the neighborhood which is now home to some of New Haven's oldest and beloved communities. Known as Dixwell, the area has been a center for learning, growth, community, and diversity for generations. With a vibrant mix of residential, commercial, and educational spaces, Dixwell is a popular destination for residents and visitors alike.

What's Going On Today?

Dixwell has experienced significant growth in recent years, with new residential developments, commercial spaces, and cultural venues adding to its dynamic landscape. This growth has not only revitalized the neighborhood but also attracted new businesses and residents, further enriching the community's tapestry of culture and history.

Yale SOM Essex

A local nonprofit is involved in several initiatives aimed at improving the quality of life for residents in Dixwell. These initiatives focus on community engagement, education, and workforce development, creating a positive impact on the neighborhood's social and economic fabric.

FAIR HAVEN

81% of the population is Hispanic/Latino

70% of residents do not have access to broadband internet

42% of families have annual incomes of $25,000 or less, with a median income of $21,049

However, looking beyond New Haven, residents of these areas often struggle with the impact of economic disparities on quality of life, education, and community well-being.

GUILFORD & MADISON

90% of residents are White

97% of adults have a high school diploma

4% of residents are Latinx

$110,000 median income

0.7% of residents are Black

$104,754 median income

What's Going On Today?

Guilford and Madison are known for their historic beauty and peaceful surroundings. With abundant natural resources and quiet neighborhoods, residents are proud of and eager to protect the natural beauty that surrounds them. Both communities have a strong sense of community, with active neighborhood associations that organize events, clean-up initiatives, and public service projects.

Yale SOM: Engaging Communities

The Yale SOM Engaging Communities program focuses on enhancing community connections through the arts, education, and civic leadership. By fostering meaningful relationships and partnerships, this initiative aims to strengthen the social fabric of Guilford and Madison, creating a more vibrant and cohesive community.
The community turns out--some meetings have people lining the walls, standing room only.

"small enough to be friendly, big enough to be interesting"

"There is a strong sense of community between my neighbors and myself in Madison. However, I also feel a commitment to New Haven, and I've established my business in downtown New Haven."

-MADISON RESIDENT

We have had times when all the relevant players - the university, unions, the city - have come together to optimize solutions.

New haven is a fabulous city – it is a microcosm of the US; very diverse. students get to engage with it; they are not isolated on a gated campus.

"Characters are what make city what it is."
Cutting Edge Models for CE Across 6 IED Domains

Housing, Regional Cooperation, Education, Civic Engagement, Workforce Development, Planning
AFFORDABLE HOUSING

Image Sources: minneapolis2040.com; Brooklyn Daily Eagle, photo by Paul Stremple
Issues with CE in Affordable Housing

CE appears to be a positive good, but in many ways, it has worked against the creation of more affordable housing in cities across the US.
“I am not the first CED lawyer to quote Arnstein’s comparison of public participation to vegetables (‘The idea of citizen participation is a little like eating spinach: no one is against it in principle because it is good for you.’) but I might be the first to wonder whether it is possible to have too much of a good thing.”

Anika Singh Lemar, Yale Law School
Carroll Gardens, Brooklyn

- Rezoning plan that encompassed 86 blocks of 3-4 story row houses with 4-5 multifamily apartment buildings
- Existing rules allowed owners with extra long front yards to build houses up to 70 feet high but these would have towered above the 50 foot high houses that were currently there
- Neighbors complained about these “pop up developments” so the Planning Commission recommended downzoning to ensure that new construction would be “more consistent with the existing scale of the neighborhood”
- Results and Consequences:
  - **Loss of potential housing units** lost because of this down-zoning
  - Neighbors who are physically close have strong incentives and organizational capacity (physical ties that reduce cost of networking and collective action) to oppose changes -- works against those who are more dispersed and disorganized that would benefit from additional housing
In their book, *Neighborhood Defenders: Participatory Politics and America's Housing Crisis*, Katherine Levine Einstein, David M Glick, Maxwell Palmer undertake a systematic study of community meetings.

- **Methods:**
  - 97 cities and towns over a 12 year time frame

- **Findings include:**
  - People of color are *disproportionately underrepresented* in land use forums
  - Older, long time residents, male
CE as a Negative Force in Affordable Housing: Beyond Anecdotal Evidence

- Additional findings include:
  - Participants often had a high level of familiarity and expertise with complex land use regulations, showcasing professional backgrounds in law, design, engineering, etc.
  - Multiple individuals in their study attended meetings with lawyers or identified as lawyers opposing projects -- advantages those with financial means for litigation
  - Neighbors coordinated with each other and organized in advance of public meetings, with this cohesion enhancing their political influence
  - Towns with more restrictive zoning regulations had more lawsuits, and the more lawsuits there were in the town, the lower the share of permitted units in multifamily buildings
RETHINKING MODELS FOR CE: AFFORDABLE HOUSING

Opportunities to Shift Practice (Schleicher)

“Balancing the Zoning Budget”
- Local governments should pass laws that require the City to **create a local “zoning budget” each year**
  - Mandatory offsetting down-zoning with up-zoning policies

“Planning An Affordable City”

- **Regularly reviewed, binding comprehensive plans** -- plans and maps that cover entire city and are difficult to unwind with subsequent amendments

- **Consequences for failing to hit development targets**
  - Some mechanism for neighborhood or citywide accountability... there should be limits on ability to do downzoning until citywide housing goals (can be defined with figures such as vacancy rates or building permits issued) are met
  - To extent city wants to build in bonuses, should do what they can to produce a “price list” ex ante to reduce information costs to outsiders

Image Sources: iStock Getty Images, Yale Law School
Opportunities to Shift Practice (Schleicher) (continued)

“City Unplanning”

- **Tax Increment Local Transfers (TILTs)** as a more effective tool for incentivizing pro-development forces, when compared to development impact fees or community benefit agreements
  - Problem with impact fees and CBAs is they are a tax on development essentially
  - TILTs say the City can dedicate increased property tax revenues to nearby neighbors in the form of property tax reductions

Image Sources: YES! Magazine, iStock Getty Images
Rigorous Structure at Meeting Level
(Singh Lemar)
“Overparticipation: Making Sense of Land Use Public Processes”

- **Meeting the public where they are (and record data!)**
  - Comprehensive planning processes ought to include public participation that emphasizes outreach to community organizations, historically disenfranchised communities, communities unlikely to attend public hearings, and communities susceptible to silencing by the public hearing atmosphere.

- **Reduce information costs and ensure that everyone has the ability to register with the City to receive notice of land use hearings**
  - This would allow affordable housing advocates, the homebuilders’ lobby, disability advocates, advocates for social services agencies and others to receive notice of individual development approval applications and use their expertise to express their support, where the local homeowners might predictably organize against a multi-family housing development, for example.

Image Sources: Curbed.com, Yale Law School
Codifying and Requiring this Rigorous Structure (Singh Lemar)

"Overparticipation: Making Sense of Land Use Public Processes"

- Adoption of Model State APA
  - Enumerate limited purposes, including housing affordability, to which zoning decisions must be directed
  - Maintain structure and keep testimony germane
  - Following receipt of public comment, a rulemaking agency must issue a final rule, accompanied by an explanatory statement that responds to "substantial arguments made in testimony and comments" (opining on veracity)
  - Requiring planners and commissioners to issue reports elucidating the results of public participation and the planners' and commissioners' responses to the comments received serves an important documentation role as well
Housing Situation in New Haven
City of New Haven Affordable Housing Task Force report, January 24, 2019

- Housing instability results in poor outcomes in education, employment, health and other related outcomes -- and this disproportionately impacts families of color
- 41% of all City households are “housing burdened” (paying in excess of 30% of household income toward rent and utilities)
  - The greatest need is at the lowest income tier with over 10,000 families living at or below 30% of the AMI experiencing rent burden
- The data suggest that an additional 25,000 affordable units are needed
### Enhancing Affordability through Fair Share in the 15-Town Region

- Task report indicates that 25K new affordable units are needed.
- Dr. Dubois-Walton notes that even if all 15 towns went to the “fair share” 10% statutory level, about 7K more units generated. Our research indicates about **7,671** additional units according to DOH data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Municipalities</th>
<th>% of affordable units</th>
<th># of affordable units</th>
<th># of units (extrapolated)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bethany</td>
<td>0.59%</td>
<td>0.59%</td>
<td>0.68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branford</td>
<td>3.24%</td>
<td>3.21%</td>
<td>3.36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Haven</td>
<td>7.70%</td>
<td>7.96%</td>
<td>8.03%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guilford</td>
<td>2.38%</td>
<td>2.39%</td>
<td>2.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamden</td>
<td>8.19%</td>
<td>8.47%</td>
<td>8.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madison</td>
<td>1.62%</td>
<td>1.64%</td>
<td>1.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meriden</td>
<td>16.06%</td>
<td>15.75%</td>
<td>16.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milford</td>
<td>5.35%</td>
<td>5.28%</td>
<td>5.31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>31.77%</td>
<td>31.88%</td>
<td>32.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Branford</td>
<td>2.29%</td>
<td>2.22%</td>
<td>2.22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Haven</td>
<td>5.08%</td>
<td>5.34%</td>
<td>5.44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orange</td>
<td>1.37%</td>
<td>1.37%</td>
<td>1.37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wallingford</td>
<td>4.13%</td>
<td>4.16%</td>
<td>4.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Haven</td>
<td>13.19%</td>
<td>13.21%</td>
<td>14.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodbridge</td>
<td>1.21%</td>
<td>1.24%</td>
<td>1.24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total | 31,167 | 31,266 | 31,950 | 38,838 |

Gain from 2017 with 10% in all 15 towns: **7,671**

Source: CT DOH Affordable Housing Appeals List
Inclusionary Zoning vis-a-vis New Haven's Existing Income Distribution

- Measuring income distribution in relation to housing consumption (per Alain Bertaud)
- Population of New Haven about 130K
- In 2019, developers completed or began 3,592 market-rate units. At a 15% level, this would equate to roughly 540 additional units of affordable housing.

**IZ policy = % of market rate housing for this part of distribution**

**Affordable housing need**
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR NEW HAVEN

1. **Reduce resistance to development**
   - **Simplify City zoning code**
     - City is desperate for development; complicated zoning code creates barrier to investment
   - **Espouse a more inclusive public participation process** whereby CMTs engage with community more proactively
   - **Consider the wisdom of TILTs and transit-oriented development programs**

2. **Tie market-rate development to affordable development in the City**
   - **Adopt an annual, binding, and comprehensive planning process that features a zoning budget**
     - The process in itself can help refine City goals
     - A budget with “teeth” will incorporate accountability and drive progress

**Fair Share:** All 15 towns achieve 10% “fair share” level of affordable units
   - Generates an estimated **7,671** additional affordable units

**Inclusionary Zoning:** Require new developments to have set percentage of affordable units
   - In 2019, developers completed or began **3,592** market-rate units. At 15% level, this would equate to roughly **540** additional units

**Idea of Interest:**
- Study the zoning shock cases of Minneapolis and California
  - Push for transit-oriented development is probably going to have more impact than moving from single family to multi-family
  - CA SB50 focused on TOD, too
Narratives

Economic Narratives: How Stories Go Viral and Drive Major Events

by Robert Shiller

Stories in which other people take action and describe the action they take

Scripts as sequences of actions, take for no other reason than that others might take them

Contagious stories are creative and innovative

Thrive on human interest (novelty), and repetition

Stories are the building blocks of narratives
NARRATIVES ON RACE & PLACE

Image Source: mappingprejudice.org
Mapping Prejudice in Minneapolis visualizes the hidden histories of race and privilege in the urban landscape

- Minneapolis has a reputation as a liberal, diverse “miracle”
- Mapping Prejudice counteracts that narrative by telling the story of racial covenants that kept people who were not white from buying property
- Along with over 3,000 volunteers, they have read, catalogued, and mapped racial covenants across the city
- They changed the narrative from an “issue of concentrated poverty” or “disinvestment in Black communities” to “systematic investment in white supremacy” and “hoarding in the white community”
- Their work serves as a foundation for change
Mapping Prejudice Uniquely Engages Community

- Volunteers read and transcribe racist covenants, coming face-to-face with the language used to create their neighborhoods and, in many cases, benefit them
  - Over 3,000 volunteers have transcribed these covenants
  - Co-creation expands the work that the team can do, but more importantly involves more people
  - The particular work of transcribing covenants can be done with a minimum of time, with limited technical skills, and remotely

Image Source: mappingprejudice.org
Mapping Prejudice Uniquely Engages Community

- Once created, the maps change narratives, and tell a vivid story of the history of Minneapolis that activists have used to make changes
  - Their work tells a story that people of color have understand and have lived
  - Maps are unique because they allow folks to see and locate themselves in history
  - Mapping Prejudice has received extensive press coverage, including a documentary that won an Emmy and has been viewed almost 500,000 times.
“That history helped people realize that the way the city is set up right now is based on the government-endorsed and sanctioned racist system.”

-Cam Gordon, City Councilman
### Minneapolis’ 2040 Plan Eliminated Single-Family Zoning

#### Narratives
- Addressing segregation
- Affordability crisis
- Fighting climate change

#### Coalitions
- Neighbors for More Neighbors
- Issue based organizations, labor unions, tenants rights organizations, environmental groups, young people, AARP

#### Community Engagement
- Go to where community members are
- Meetings in a box
- Encourage meeting attendance
Mapping projects have proven replicable

- Mapping Prejudice was inspired by successful projects in Seattle and Richmond and has inspired projects in DC and Hartford, among many others.
Ideas to approach mapping history in New Haven

- There is plenty of existing data on the history of redlining in New Haven
  - Thanks to Datahaven for the map on the left
- Racial covenants pre-date red-lining and covenants exist outside of specific areas that had HOLC maps made
- A regional approach, looking to include the suburbs might make sense, but potentially require more regional cooperation
Recommendations to New Haven

Mapping Prejudice Lessons:

- What status-quo narratives fail to capture the full picture? What data can create a deeper understanding? How can you gather it?
- What history do people in New Haven need to understand?
  - What do people of color already know?
- Are there projects that would be impossible to tackle on your own? How could volunteers help?
- What knowledge and resources are being created in institutions of higher learning that could be mobilized for the good of the city?
- Who can use your support?

2040 Plan Lessons:

- Be intentional about who you want to hear from: who gets missed in traditional community engagement?
  - What's the best way to reach them?
    - Consider local events
    - Meetings in a box
    - Support at community meetings
    - Ask big-picture questions that they can answer
- Who should be included in coalitions? What issues appeal to them?
- What narratives need to be counteracted? What evidence would appeal to them?
Why Integration Is Important and the Role of Narratives:

- Our history books often cite the 1954 *Brown v. Board of Education* decision as the end of segregation. Yet public schools remain largely segregated and by many metrics, segregation has actually increased.

- Persistent factors continue to drive segregation such as:
  - Housing discrimination (only explains 76% of the variation in school segregation across cities)
  - School district mapping
  - School financing and funding allocations

- Some initiatives tend to help:
  - School choice programs, neighborhood integration, increased Funding

- Why is integration so important anyway?
  - One of the best tools to achieve racial equity! (Rucker Johnson’s study)
  - Segregation can contribute to a dangerous “us” and “them” narrative at the detriment of all
  - Integration, on the other hand, promotes community, fosters tolerance, and improves the outcomes of all.

- A key means of achieving integration is by assessing individual students’ needs and reallocating resources to efficiently meet these needs.
Segregation in New Haven Public Schools: Many New Haven schools are racially imbalanced or even racially isolated:

- **Connecticut** has achievement gaps that are higher than the national average, and **New Haven** has achievement gaps that are higher than the state average.
- 2017: 31.4% of New Haven students reached "grade level" in English and only 20.8% of students reached "grade level" in Math.
- The average New Haven school ranking is in the bottom 50% of public schools in Connecticut
- **Minority enrollment is 87% of the student body (majority Hispanic and Black),** which is more than the Connecticut public school average of 46% (majority Hispanic).

- **Half of New Haven schools are profoundly segregated,** meaning most black and Hispanic students will rarely sit in a classroom that has any white students.
  - Church Street Elementary School (Hamden): Roughly 80% of all students are black or Hispanic
  - Lincoln-Bassett Elementary School (Newhallville) has a 95% black or Hispanic student body

- On the other side of the racial imbalance, around **85% of all students in Guilford and Madison public schools are white** and only around 7% of students are low income. These districts:
  - Spend more on K-12 education per pupil, adult education, payments to governments, private or charter schools than the state average
  - Have some of the highest rated schools in the area and the state
  - Have a majority of students who consistently perform better than the state average in all metrics
SEGREGATION IN PUBLIC EDUCATION

“My vision for IntegrateNYC is to be able to totally transition this organization over to a team of young adults who came through our organization as young people but are shifting to take on the work with their own approach and their own experiences, engaging young people that we may or may not have thought about or seen when we started this work.”

- Sarah Camiscoli, Founder of IntegrateNYC

BOTTOM UP Model to Learn from: IntegrateNYC

- IntegrateNYC is a youth-led organization that works toward more integration and equity within New York public schools.
  - A teacher's realization of students' needs from within the classroom:
    "I walked into an ESL classroom, and I introduced myself in both English and Spanish, and I had a Latino student raise his hand and say, 'Miss, I don't speak Spanish.'"
    "I asked different questions about segregation and realized that many of the reforms and interventions that were designed to support black and Latino youth communities were very ill-fitted because they were placed within the context of a severely socioeconomically segregated school system."
  - Community engagement can be a powerful tool to assess the specific needs of students and incorporate these voices into decision-making processes. IntegrateNYC puts students at the forefront of decision making
    - School lunch intervention

- It focuses on students as the experts on the impacts of segregation and inequality in the school system, and turns to young people to influence solutions and policy, focusing on public schools as an institution of democracy through a youth board.
  - This empowers students and emphasizes relationship building as a means of hearing students' needs at a micro level and translating those voices into macro changes.

- Their model relies on the 5 R's of integration and highlights the importance of community engagement and relationship building as a means of hearing the needs of students to best serve those needs.
  - 62 point platform
  - Support of 70 nonprofits
Jefferson County Public Schools are 49% white, 37% black, 14% Latino and remarkably economically diverse. Yet there is no divide between inner-city and suburban schools.

The City of Louisville combined its government with Jefferson County’s in 2003, sharing tax revenues and resources throughout the entire metro area, so that prosperity in one part of the county both directly and indirectly affects parts of the area lacking prosperity.

- The district puts schools in clusters of diverse neighborhoods. Parents fill out an application listing their preferences for schools in the cluster and the district assigns students to certain schools to achieve diversity goals, based on this rank preference.
- Parents can also apply to magnet schools and for special programs such as Spanish-language immersion.

The system ranks census blocks on factors including the racial makeup, the educational attainment of adults, and household income. Then it mixes up students from various blocks.
TOP DOWN Model to Learn from: Louisville, Kentucky

- This has led to **higher achievement outcomes** for low-income students, which created a **better workforce** for the metropolitan area.

- Studies have shown that students who attended integrated schools in Jefferson County were **better prepared to work with people from different racial or ethnic backgrounds** than those who did not.

- Integration also **reduced white flight from the city to the suburbs**, keeping home values and tax revenues stable.

- The demographic makeup of downtown Louisville and its neighboring suburbs parallels that of New Haven and its suburbs. **This is a model that could work effectively in broader New Haven to integrate schools, with positive spillovers into less volatile housing prices and taxes.**
Youth Stat New Haven: A Program that Identifies and Addresses Students' Needs: A Community Engagement Initiative in New Haven

- Youth Stat is a school-based intervention that seeks to reduce justice involvement and city youth violence of students of all ages in New Haven schools. It also seeks to improve the health and wellness of these students by pairing them with necessary services to aid in their engagement and development.

- Youth Stat uses data intervention models to improve students’ school engagement and academic performance, while connecting students to services or communities tailored to more specific needs.

- These services include tutoring, academic support, gang intervention, mental health treatment, employment matching, and employment placement.

- Youth Stat is partnered with 29 different organizations all across New Haven and it is extensive and wide reaching, allowing the City to identify disengaged youth and offer interventions and other services to those youth.
Existing Integration Tools: Interdistrict Magnet Schools

- On average achievement increases when parents have more school choice. Over the last 10 years the state has spent $1.4B on magnet schools throughout CT, many of which are in NH, but it often takes a while to see the positive impacts of funding like this.

- Currently, New Haven has magnet schools, neighborhood schools, interdistrict magnet schools, and charter schools that New Haven residents (and some suburban residents) can apply to, which give parents and students some school choice.

- Any Connecticut resident can apply to the interdistrict magnet schools which serve special education students, English language learners, and gifted students.
  - There are no admissions requirements, tests, or prerequisites to gain entry into these schools and no student may be denied enrollment because of race, ethnicity, or disability.
  - Interdistrict magnet schools can reduce racial isolation and foster racial, ethnic, and economic diversity among students.
  - However, in the New Haven context, three schools have been fined for not meeting racial isolation benchmarks and more than half of the magnet schools are less diverse than the district as a whole.

Information campaigns that encourage a broader, more diverse applicant pool may help further integrate these schools.
Implement the 5R's of Real Integration from the IntegrateNYC model in order to further reduce school segregation:

1. Racial Integration: Who is in your school?
2. Resource Allocation: What is in your school?
3. Relationships Across Group Identity: How do people in your school relate to one another and their differences? How do students and teachers learn to build across differences?
4. Restorative Justice: Who is punished in your school and how?
5. Teacher Representation: Who teaches and leads in your school?

Look into IntegrateNYC's 62 points

Learn from the Louisville model in which regional tax sharing and effective busing led to widespread school desegregation with positive spillovers into less volatile housing prices.

Research the effectiveness of a regional tax sharing program in all of New Haven County
- Expand upon existing links between downtown New Haven and its high opportunity suburbs like Guilford and Madison
- Learn more about the shortcomings of interdistrict magnet schools to assess how to improve the existing framework
- Build upon existing assets like YouthStat

Assess the individual needs of students within the community and reallocate existing financial resources to meet these students’ needs, using some of New Haven's many existing nonprofit organizations.
RETHINKING CIVIC ENGAGEMENT
CIVIC ENGAGEMENT / OLD WAY

Technical Efficiency v. Civic Efficiency

Tool
Technology (rapid uptake & "smart" cities)

Goal
Technical Efficiency (less “friction”)

Desired Outcome
Trust

Technology is a double-edged sword: generating efficient solutions at the cost of bypassing the processes that generate solutions
- Absence of process has the opposite impact of undermining trust
- Example: Boston Public Schools change in start times (2017)

How might we think about human interactions in civic engagement and “friction as a feature and not a bug?”
What We Can Learn from Play

What if we built in meaningful inefficiencies, or slack in the system, that force people to engage with the system?

Consider playing a game:
- Inherently inefficient
- Unnecessary obstacles so players find meaning in the process
- Goal is simply to play

Play often set aside from “serious work,” but playing can connect people to the world through action and the process of making the world through moments of productive encounter.

The intentional cultivation of difficulty, confined within clear structure, for the purpose of meaning-making, is a kind of playfulness.

Meaningful Inefficiency:
“the productive lag in systems generated by rules that enforces and justifies playing”
(Network building, holding space, distributing ownership, persistent input)

Tool
“Meaningful inefficiency”

Goal
Care

Desired Outcome
Trust
Community PlanIt

- Reimagining community planning meetings which can often lack productivity, inclusivity, and engagement
- Online game platform where players gain awareness about key civic issues, learn about the planning process, connect with each other, and suggest solutions to problems → culminates in an in-person community event
- Not only facilitates trust-building between citizens and gov't but serves as a powerful data collection tool through public engagement
CIVIC ENGAGEMENT / NEW APPROACHES

Participatory Budgeting - Youth Lead the Change
Gives young people power over one million dollars of the city budget. Voting takes place online, at community centers, parks and museums, and in Boston Public Schools.

1. Assemble steering committee of public, include underserved communities
2. Collect initial ideas from Boston residents
3. “Change agent” volunteers develop proposals with youth and City
4. Youth (age 12-22) vote on which proposal they want funded
5. Youth, City and stakeholders work together to put winning projects in place

ADAPTING AND EVOLVING NEW APPROACHES

311 app
- City of Boston had $385M+ repair backlog, with $11M spent annually on repairs
- Introduced app to increase public reporting of non-emergency issues, enhancing public trust

Streetcaster
- 311 app was disproportionately used by high-income neighborhoods; only 1.1% repairs were in lowest SES neighborhoods
- Introduced Streetcaster to assess needs and allow city to reallocate funding more equitably

https://www.boston.gov/departments/new-urban-mechanics/streetcaster
Consider the impact of city initiatives on **public trust**: When is **efficiency** the right goal?

Experiment with building meaningful inefficiencies in civic planning, seeking **public engagement**, but not engagement for its own sake - emphasize **process** and **flexibility**.

**Creative methods** to consider:
- Online dialogue
- Creative storytelling
- Data visualization

**New Haven resources** to leverage:
- Non-profits
- Community planning teams
- Neighborhood organizations/coalitions

Measuring progress by evaluating:
- **Network building**: Have you developed new connections in the community you’re working in?
- **Holding space**: Are you taking steps to engage people outside of your immediate network?
- **Distributed ownership**: Are you creating opportunities for stewardship by stakeholders?
- **Persistent input**: Are you engaged in long term conversations with stakeholders?

---

**RECOMMENDATIONS TO NEW HAVEN**

Measuring progress by evaluating:
- **Network building**: Have you developed new connections in the community you’re working in?
- **Holding space**: Are you taking steps to engage people outside of your immediate network?
- **Distributed ownership**: Are you creating opportunities for stewardship by stakeholders?
- **Persistent input**: Are you engaged in long term conversations with stakeholders?

---

[Graph showing Civic Media Practice]

---

[Diagram showing Longevity vs. Novelty]

---

**public trust!**
WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT

Image Source: jvs-boston.org
REGIONAL ACTION/ ANCHOR PARTNERSHIPS

Narratives: Need for Multi-Stakeholder Action

- History & narrative that certain communities lack access and qualification for certain jobs
- Shiller: “A story’s contagion rate is unaffected by its underlying truth”
- Dodson: Proximity & exposure is the best/only way to combat these narratives
- Rubin: Relationship between employer/employee interests, mutual reliance at heart of the strategy
- Inclusive development begins with existing people, networks, assets in the community

Our theory of change requires intermediary organizations to bridge employers, clients, and communities...

...the following national models may serve as inspiration for how successful NH orgs can further excel
Key elements of multi-stakeholder WF intermediary:

1. **Dual-stakeholder model**: Clients + employers as customers

2. **Anchor employer relationships**: Understand needs, build trust, deliver value → forge longer-term pipeline


4. **Proximity & range of ramps**: Work to create exposure, variety of ‘entry points’, for so-called “non-traditional” clients

5. **Top-level engagement**: Sr. leadership drives culture change

6. **Functional engagement**: Relationships with HR / WF development teams create day-to-day, bilateral value

7. **Advocacy**: Direct intervention in false / inaccurate narratives
How to get there: MADE IN DURHAM (Durham, NC)

- Successful WFD is as much a question of culture and mindset as one of policy and practice
  - Made in Durham broadly aims to shift the mindset from one of external talent recruitment to internal talent development
- Original WFD framing focused on deficiencies of labor supply rather than precise nature of labor demand
  - Projected 1000 biotech jobs which require post secondary credential less than BA in 3-4 years in Durham area
  - Youth leaders were demanding work-based learning experiences from public schools and community colleges, leading to better CTE programs
- Made in Durham strives to serve as intermediary which exposes youth to series of options, with a variety of corresponding actual opportunities driven by employer demand
  - Value proposition for employers: hiring local engenders high loyalty, produces lower turnover, and gives companies the chance to form and forge the workforce they need
- Both philanthropic and public support are necessary
How to get there: JVS (Boston, MA)

- Strong, contextualized training/experiential learning coupled with coaching; coaches face both employee and employer, acting as both social workers and staffing professionals
- Deep expertise in Healthcare sector (70% of clients) + deep employer relationships, primarily at HR / Hiring Manager level
  - Developed job quality assessment tool, rated across 5 client-generated categories
  - Created talent pipeline model for specific positions; recruit candidates, employer pre-selects, JVS rolls out training, if completed that job is guaranteed and begin once trained; model allowed to negotiate with employer around job quality
- Participated in first RCT assessing impact WFD and sectoral job training programs
  - results showed clear impact of training on earnings differential
- Has worked with employer partners to develop Career Ladder programs
- ~15% of revenue from employer fees; mixture of city, state, philanthropic support
APPLYING LEARNINGS TO NEW HAVEN

Broader Connecticut Backdrop
- Bottom 10 in job creation despite credentialed workforce
- Key Hurdles: infrastructure; regulation; cost of doing business
- Pockets of success: growth in absolute- & well-paying manufacturing jobs

Areas of Opportunity
- Biotech & Health Services → existing relationships & high jobs multiplier
  - New Haven Works (Yale University; Yale New Haven Health)
  - ConnCAT
- Remote Work → cost efficiency
  - virtual analytical and experimental design positions

Existing Challenges
- Technological (re)training → generational divides; funding
- Employer buy-in → proactivity, not reactivity; define as area of need
Recommendation to New Haven

1) Focus on Remote Work → Lower Cost of Doing Business
   ○ Leverage existing biotechnology and health care services relationships
   ○ Focus funding on technology (re)training programs

2) Develop Early Programs for Long-Term Employee Flexibility
   ○ Create culture of talent development without binding employees to limited subset of employers
   ○ While *New Haven Works* trains and places individuals with pre-existing work experience, limited academic apprenticeship programs
   ○ Need to establish internship / exposure partnerships at secondary / tertiary school level

**Illustrative, Executable Proposal**
   ○ Work with local partners - workforce development organizations and employers alike - in aggressively exploring opportunities to position New Haven as leader in COVID-19 contact tracing
   ○ Structure program to identify/train both existing workforce and local youth seeking employment
   ○ Build upon partnerships post-COVID to strengthen employment pipeline relationship
Cities across the United States -- including New Haven -- face a staggering need for infrastructure investment, but many cities do not realize the full value of the assets they manage, and can therefore not use them to the public’s benefit.

An **urban wealth fund** enables a city to more transparently manage and maximize the value of publicly-owned commercial assets for the benefit of the public.
Urban Wealth Fund

How it works

1. Create a balance sheet for the city’s public commercial assets, social assets, and human assets
2. Allow for professional management through an incorporated holding company (the urban wealth fund)
3. Adopt a mindset of long-term investments

Principles

In order to effectively function, a UWF must embody three equally important principles:

- **Transparency**: Allows for oversight and accountability
- **Clear objective of value maximization**: Multiple goals can result in poor outcomes
- **Political independence**: Relieves government from inherent commercial risk and allows assets to be managed in line with their natural life cycles
CPH City & Port Development

Professional management of public assets led to the revitalization of Copenhagen. Investment in public land enabled the city to fund a new metro, and privatization of harbor management and redevelopment made the harbor profitable for the first time in a century.

Alaska Permanent Fund

Twenty-five percent of non-renewable energy royalties, lease rentals, sales proceeds go into the APF for public benefit. As of June 2019, the Alaska Permanent Fund Corporation had $66 billion AUM. Every qualifying Alaskan resident receives an annual dividend.

Temasek, Singapore

Founded in 1974 as a separate holding company, Temasek consolidated all government-owned commercial assets. It “deliver[s] a significant surplus to the government, enough to continuously help fund the development of the city-state as well as to shore up the equity to increase the net worth of the public sector balance sheet to provide for future generations.”[1]
## Urban Wealth Fund

### New Haven Assets:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Public Spaces/Connectivity</th>
<th>Transportation/Infrastructure</th>
<th>Business</th>
<th>Real Assets</th>
<th>Nonmajor Enterprise Funds</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Long Wharf</td>
<td>Union Station and State Street Station</td>
<td>The District</td>
<td>Urban Tree Canopy</td>
<td>Golf Course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Downtown Crossing</td>
<td>Tweed Airport</td>
<td>Bioscience, Tech &amp; Innovation</td>
<td>~90 Brownfield Sites</td>
<td>Skating Rink</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hill-to-Downtown</td>
<td>Port of New Haven</td>
<td>Food &amp; Manufacturing</td>
<td>Land &amp; Municipal Buildings</td>
<td>East Rock Communications Tower</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Urban Wealth Fund

Capital Assets
At June 30, 2019, the City had $1.6 billion invested in a broad range of capital assets, including land, construction in process, buildings, vehicles and equipment, roads, bridges and storm sewer lines.

City of New Haven, Connecticut
Capital Assets
(Net of Depreciation)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land</td>
<td>$44,140,306</td>
<td>$44,140,306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction in process</td>
<td>26,964,194</td>
<td>49,214,066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land improvements</td>
<td>10,850,724</td>
<td>11,020,951</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building and improvements</td>
<td>1,348,823,292</td>
<td>1,330,169,729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Machinery, equipment, furniture, fixtures and other related assets</td>
<td>33,517,301</td>
<td>32,629,566</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicles</td>
<td>12,629,600</td>
<td>12,696,525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>117,319,478</td>
<td>113,745,455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,594,244,895</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,593,616,598</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Major projects during FY19 included commitments for economic development, engineering, parks, technology and education.

Urban Wealth Fund

Empirical Analysis/Methodology

Estimate Market Value of Capital Assets
- Inputs: Book value of assets ~$1.6B (including land, municipal buildings, infrastructure)
- Assumption: Market value of assets based on steep haircut to Boston multiple (as a function of GDP)
- Intrinsic value of $10.2B (6.4x book value)

Model Return on Assets
- Inputs: revenue and market value appreciation
- Assumption: conservative yield of 3% applied to indicative value
- Use of Base, Upside, and Downside scenarios (pre-Covid-19), ex:
  - Upside: 3%
  - Base: in line with CT GDP growth
  - Downside: in line with inflation

Portfolio Management & Monitoring
- Select independent asset managers
- Maintain ongoing inventory of assets and create data fields to collect and record relevant data
- Improve balance sheet reporting and management
- Add New Haven non-capital assets
Under a new mayoral administration, New Haven is seeking to rebuild the city's image to encompass one of trustworthiness, transparency, and accessibility. Mayor Elicker has established four primary areas of focus to support this mission.

"...an opportunity to change the past and work together for growth and betterment of all."
- Mayor Justin Elicker
ROLE OF VISION FOR THE CITY

Mariana Mazzucato's work

- Chance for public sector to shift the narrative
- Directs resources and talent
- Inspires citizenry
- De-risks and escalates private sector investments aligned with vision
- Research will spin-off general purpose technologies of immense value
ROLE OF VISION FOR THE CITY

Who could we be?

Examples

Philadelphia/Urbane Development

Lawrence/Working Cities Challenge

The New York Times

*One City’s Road to Recovery Offers Lessons, and Hope*

Lawrence, Mass., once an industrial power, set out to reverse a long decline with the Federal Reserve’s help. Now it faces a new economic challenge.
ROLE OF VISION FOR THE CITY

New Haven in the Green New Deal

- Opportunity to lead a historic energy transition
- Leverage Yale School of the Environment
  - Mayor Elicker alum
- Focus local research; university and private
- Unlock federal funding
- Attract and retain impact-focused talent
- Build City resilience in the face of coastal climate change
- Train for jobs of the future
Recommendation to New Haven

URBAN WEALTH FUND
1) Conduct an audit of New Haven's assets to determine intrinsic portfolio value
2) Create investment partnerships across public and private actors to enhance public participation in value creation (i.e. revenue sharing, co-investments, etc.)

VISION SETTING FOR THE CITY
3) Create a narrative that connects New Haven's assets with a vision for what the City could be
4) Formulate New Haven's moonshot and the role of the public sector
Key takeaways

1. Narratives matter: IED is both technical and cultural

2. Community engagement for what?

3. Meaningful participation can drive second order effects

Reimagine vision of public sector value
Thank you!

Yale SOM Inclusive Economic Development Lab

To request further information on the work of the 2020 IEDL contact: kate.cooney@yale.edu